

**REPORT ON THE VERIFICATION OF THE PUBLISHED DOCUMENTS AND INFORMATION THAT THE MUNICIPALITIES, ZELS AND CENTERS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF PLANNING REGIONS IN THE REPUBLIC OF NORTH MACEDONIA AS HOLDERS OF THE INFORMATION ARE OBLIGED TO PUBLISH ON THEIR WEBSITES:**

The Agency for the Protection of the Right to Free Access to Public Information, in accordance with its competencies, carried out monitoring of 88 holders, i.e. on the websites of municipalities, the Community of Local Self-Government Units and Centers for the Development of Planning Regions, and published on the List of holders of information on the Agency's website. The monitoring was carried out in the period from July 1 to 20, 2021. The Department of Cooperation and Analysis was in charge of monitoring the full publication of documents and information that information holders are obliged to publish on their websites according to Article 10 of the Law on Free Access to Public Information.

Proactively published information of the holders should be easily accessible and understandable, usable, relevant to citizens and regularly updated. Information is a prerequisite for responsible government and a basis for democratic processes - information about the work of the holders enables citizens to adequately draw conclusions and participate in decision-making on issues that are of interest. Transparency and access to public information are indivisible instruments in the fight against corruption.

It should be emphasized that the web pages of the monitored holders are updated according to their activities and they have their function as the first informant for the citizens and the services they provide. However, we should emphasize that for the most part, the web pages of the information holders do not publish the data of their competencies and do not systematize the information in accordance with Article 10 of the Law on FAPI. We also want to emphasize that unsystematized information creates confusion among citizens for easy access to the information they need, and is in accordance with the legal obligation for transparency of the holders of public information. Hence, we appeal to the municipal authorities to make the information available for use by citizens with a maximum of three clicks. "Informed citizens, satisfied citizens", is the maxim for transparent municipal government.

According to the established methodology, in relation to Article 10 of the Law, a check was made as to whether the monitored holders have published all 22 categories of information that they are obliged to publish on their websites and in relation to whether the published information is complete and up-to-date. Namely, each type of fully and up-to-date published information was assessed with a grade 1, each partial publication of the required information was evaluated with a score of 0.5, and each unpublished (or non-transparently published) information was evaluated with 0 points.

Depending on the total number of points that the monitored holders received in relation to the published necessary documents and

information in accordance with Article 10 of the Law, a gradation was made of the degree of fulfilment of the legal obligation for their active transparency, as follows: holders with many low levels of transparency who have between 0 and 6 points, with a low level between 7 and 10 points, medium level holders between 10 and 14 points, and with a high level of transparency between 17 and 22 points. In doing so, it was determined that 8 holders have a high level of transparency in relation to the published information, 39 have a medium level of transparency, 24 have a low level and 17 have a very low level of fulfilment in terms of active transparency.

The monitoring showed that the municipality of Valandovo has 20 points out of a possible 22 according to Article 10 of the Law on FAPI, followed by the municipalities of Demir Hisar and Kočani with 19 points each. As good examples, which have complied with Article 10 in a quick and simple way, the municipalities of Valandovo and Demir Hisar have systematized the 22 required categories in accordance with the legal obligation as follows:

Municipality of Valandovo:

<https://www.valandovo.gov.mk/%D0%9E%D0%BF%D1%88%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BD%D0%B8/%D0%94%D0%BE%D0%BA%D1%83%D0%BC%D0%B5%D0%BD%D1%82%D0%B8/%D0%A2%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%BD%D1%81%D0%BF%D0%B0%D1%80%D0%B5%D0%BD%D1%82%D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82.aspx>

and the Municipality of Demir Hisar:

<https://www.demirhisar.gov.mk/sloboden-pristap-do-informacii.html>

With these two examples, we want to point out to the rest of the municipal authorities to arrange the active transparency of their websites by following these holders, which will bring their operations closer to the citizens and also increase their transparency and accountability.

The Agency, conducting the monitoring, determined that the active transparency among the holders is still at a level that requires the municipalities to improve in their proactivity towards the citizens and to place the information they publish in a separate banner/link under the title LIST OF INFORMATION, so that the same will be available to applicants and thus will reduce the number of requests for free access to public information.

In the future, in the training that the Agency continuously organizes for officials with information holders, it will emphasize active transparency and consistent application of Article 10 of the Law on FAPI, because in this way holders help citizens to better understand the functioning of the institutions, their rights and obligations, the way in which they can influence the making of decisions that are reflected on their daily living and work, as well as to make it easier for them to access the services offered by the institutions under the jurisdiction of the local self-government.

**TABLE OF RANKING HOLDERS:**

<b>Ordered no.</b>	<b>Municipality</b>	<b>Points</b>	<b>A legend</b>
1	Municipality of Valandovo	20	Municipalities with a high level of transparency
2	Municipality of Demir Hisar	19	
3	Municipality of Kočani	19	
4	Municipality of Bitola	18,5	
5	Kriva Palanka municipality	18	
6	Municipality of Veles	17,5	
7	Municipality of Berovo	17,5	
8	Municipality of Delchevo	17	
9	Municipality of Ohrid	16	Municipalities with a medium level of transparency
10	Stip municipality	16	
11	Municipality of Chaska	16	
12	Municipality of Konche	15,5	
13	Municipality of Gevgelija	15,5	
14	Municipality of Prilep	15	

15	<b>Municipality of Sveti Nikola</b>	<b>15</b>	
16	<b>Municipality of Zrnovci</b>	<b>14,5</b>	
17	<b>Municipality of Kumanovo</b>	<b>14,5</b>	

18	<b>Municipality of Makedonska Kamenica</b>	<b>14,5</b>
19	<b>Municipality of Karposh</b>	<b>14,5</b>
20	<b>Municipality of Novaci</b>	<b>14</b>
21	<b>Municipality of Vasilevo</b>	<b>14</b>
22	<b>Center municipality</b>	<b>13,5</b>
23	<b>Municipality of Strumica</b>	<b>13,5</b>
24	<b>Municipality of Krushevo</b>	<b>13,5</b>
25	<b>Municipality of Probishtip</b>	<b>13,5</b>
26	<b>Municipality of Mavrovo and Rostusha</b>	<b>13,5</b>
27	<b>Municipality of Makedonski Brod</b>	<b>13,5</b>
28	<b>Municipality of Gradsko</b>	<b>13,5</b>
29	<b>Municipality of Debrca</b>	<b>13</b>
30	<b>Municipality of Pehchevo</b>	<b>13</b>

31	Municipality of Bosilovo	13
32	Municipality of Gazi Baba	12,5
33	Municipality of Radovish	12,5
34	Municipality of Resen	12,5
35	Municipality of Bogdanci	12
36	Municipality of Novo Selo	12
37	Center for Development of Eastern Planning Region-Stip	12
38	Municipality of Kavadarci	11,5
39	Mogila municipality	11,5
40	Municipality of Vinica	11,5
41	The City of Skopje	11
42	Airport municipality	10,5
43	Kisela Voda municipality	10,5
44	Municipality of Želino	10,5

45 Municipality of Cheshinovo-Obleshevo 10

		48	Kicevo municipality	9,5
46	Center for Development of the Vardar Planning Region - Ve	49	Rosoman municipality	9,5
47	Center for Development of the South-Eastern Planning Regi Strumica	50	Centar Zupa municipality	9,5

51	Municipality of Kratovo	63	Municipality of Sopsishte	8
52	Municipality of Debar	64	Municipality of Gjorce Petrov	7,5
53	Municipality of Tetovo	65	Municipality of Demir Kapija	7,5
54	Municipality of Petrovec	66	Municipality of Gostivar	7,5
55	Municipality of Ilinden	67	Shuto Orizari municipality	7,5
56	ZELS	68	Municipality of Bogovinje	7,5
57	Municipality of Vevcani	69	Rankovce municipality	7,5
58	Municipality of Karbinci	70	Municipality of Tearce	7,5
59	Municipality of Brvenica	71	Center for Development of the South-West Planning Region - Struga	7
60	Municipality of Dolneni			
61	Municipality of Negotino			
62	Municipality of Struga			

Municipalities with a low level of transparency

72 Municipality of Butel 6,5

73	Municipality of Saraj	74	Krivogastani municipality	6
		75	Chair Municipality	6

76	<b>Center for the Development of the Skopje Planning Region-Skopje</b>
77	<b>Municipality of Lipkovo</b>
78	<b>Municipality of Lozovo</b>
79	<b>Municipality of Studeničani</b>
80	<b>Center for Development of North-Eastern Planning Region Kumanovo</b>
81	<b>Municipality of Jegunovce</b>
82	<b>Municipality of Dojran</b>
83	<b>Municipality of Chucher Sandevo</b>
84	<b>Municipality of Staro Nagoricane</b>
85	<b>Municipality of Plasnica</b>
86	<b>Municipality of Zelenikovo</b>
87	<b>Municipality of Vrapcishte</b>
88	<b>Municipality of Arachinovo</b>

Municipalities with a very low level of transparency