REPORT ON THE VERIFICATION OF THE PUBLISHED DOCUMENTS AND INFORMATION THAT THE STATE INSTITUTIONS IN THE REPUBLIC OF NORTH MACEDONIA AS INFORMATION HOLDERS ARE OBLIGED TO PUBLISH ON YOUR WEBSITES:

Name of Indicator 48: Percentage of institutions that regularly publish and update on their websites the documents that they are obliged to publish and update according to the Law on free access to public information, for Measure 3.4.1 Strengthening the mechanisms for the availability of public information.

According to the Action Plan for the implementation of the Public Administration Reform Strategy 2018-2023, Measure 3.4.1.6 is foreseen in the special objective. Strengthening the mechanisms for the availability of public information.

The Agency for the Protection of the Right to Free Access to Public Information for this purpose in 2021, conducted monitoring of the websites of the holders from the central government.

The monitoring was conducted following Article 10 of the Law on Free Access to Public Information (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia No. 101/2019).

Out of a total of 144 state institutions recorded in the List as holders, the websites of 116 holders were monitored. Thirteen holders were not covered by the monitoring, because they do not have their websites. The website of one holder (Bureau of Metrology) could not be analyzed because it was hacked, while 13 regional units of the State Attorney's Office of the Republic of North Macedonia are an integral part of the State Attorney's Office.

This year, the monitoring was carried out according to a new methodology implemented in cooperation with external experts, hired by the IPA II Project: Transparency and Accountability of Public Administration", whose end user is the Agency. The prepared questionnaire contained a total of 34 questions arising from Article 10 of the Law. Some of them contained one or more sub-questions, and the maximum number of possible points was 56. Holders of the published data received 0, 0.5 and 1 points, depending on the number and update of the published documents.

The questionnaire was distributed to the holders, who were asked to carry out a self-evaluation of their transparency.

Within the deadline for submitting the answers to the Agency, the holders answered 83 questionnaires, 20 of which did not contain links to the specific documents as requested and were not taken into account during the monitoring of the web pages. Part of the questions contained in Article 10 were not filled in because the holders do not have a legal obligation to conclude such agreements, which affected the number of points received.

Depending on the total number of points that the monitored holders received in relation to the published necessary documents and information in accordance with Article 10 of the Law, a gradation was made of the degree of fulfilment of the legal obligation for their active transparency, as follows: holders with many low levels of transparency who have between 0 and 20 points, with a low level between 20 and 30 points, medium level holders between 30 and 40 points, and with a high level of transparency between 40 and 56 points. In doing so, it was determined that 26 holders have a high level of transparency in relation to published information, 53 have a medium level of transparency, 27 have a low level and 10 have a very low level of compliance in terms of active transparency.

According to the results of the monitoring, the most transparent is the Government of the Republic of North Macedonia-General Secretariat, ie the

Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning with 48 points, followed by the Ministry of Economy with 47 and the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy with 46.5 points.

Attached: Table with the monitoring results.

| RB | INSTITUTION | POINTS | LEGEND |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|------------------------|
| 1 | the Republic of North Macedonia Government - General Secretariat | 48 | Institutions with high |
| 2 | Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning | 48 | level of transparency |
| 3 | Ministry of Economy | 47 | |
| 4 | Ministry of Labor and Social Policy | 46,5 | |
| 5 | Bureau of Public Procurement | 46 | |
| 6 | Ministry of Information Society and Administration | 46 | |
| 7 | Customs Administration of the Republic of North Macedonia | 46 | |
| 8 | Food and Veterinary Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia | 45,5 | |
| 9 | Ministry of Defense | 45,5 | |
| 10 | Radiation Safety Directorate | 45 | |
| 11 | Ministry of Justice | 45 | |
| 12 | Agency for financial support in agriculture and rural development | 44,5 | |
| 13 | State Audit Office | 44 | |
| 14 | State Administrative Inspectorate | 43,5 | |
| 15 | Regional Development Bureau | 42,5 | |
| 16 | Ministry of Finance | 42,5 | |
| 17 | State Market Inspectorate | 42 | |

| 18 | the Republic of North Macedonia Government - Office of the President of the Government of the Republic of North Macedonia | 42 |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 19 | Securities Commission of the Republic of North Macedonia | 42 |
| 20 | Pension and disability insurance fund of the Republic of North Macedonia | 42 |
| 21 | Accreditation Institute of the Republic of North Macedonia | 41 |
| 22 | Real estate cadastre agency | 40,5 |
| 23 | State Commission for Prevention of Corruption | 40,5 |
| 24 | Agency for audio and audiovisual media services | 40 |
| 25 | Agency for Supervision of Capital Funded Pension Insurance MAPAS | 40 |
| 26 | Innovation and Technological Development Fund | 40 |

| วด | 5 | Institutions | with | secondary |
|-------|---|--------------|------|-----------|
| ייינו | | | | |

| | 27 State Statistical Office 39 | , ₅ Instit | tutions with secondary | |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| | | 37 | Directorate for Security of Classified Information | 37 |
| 28 | State archive of the Republic of North Macedonia | 38 | | |
| 29 | State Inspectorate for Construction and Urbanism | | • | 37 |
| 20 | Administration for Bublis Bossesson Comment Directorate C | 39 | State Examination Center | 36,5 |
| 30 | Administration for Public Revenues-General Directorate-S | 40 | Commission on relations with religious communities and religious groups | 36,5 |
| 31 | Ministry of Health | | | |
| | - | 41 | Inspection Council | 36 |
| 32 | Ministry of Education and Science | 42 | Institute for Standardization of the Republic of North Macedonia | 36 |
| 33 | National Bank of the Republic of North Macedonia | | missions for Standard Leading of the Republic of North Massacina | |
| | | 43 | Ministry of Internal Affairs | 36 |
| 34 | Geological Institute of the Republic of North Macedonia | 4.4 | Lawislatian Carnataniat | 25.5 |
| 25 | Administration Assum | 44 | Legislation Secretariat | 35,5 |
| 35 | Administration Agency | 45 | Electronic Communications Agency | 35 |
| 36 | Energy Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia | | | |

| 46 | Personal Data Protection Agency | 52 | Ministry of Transport and Communications | |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 47 | State Labor Inspectorate | 53 | Employment Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia | 34 |
| 48 | Agency for encouraging the development of agriculture - | 54 | Agency for promotion and support of tourism | 34 |
| 49 | Directorate for Mandatory Reserves of Oil and Oil Derivati | 55 | Agency for foreign investments and export promotion of the Republic of | 34 |
| 50 | State Inspectorate for Agriculture | | North Macedonia | |
| 51 | State Commission for decision-making in administrative pand employment proceedings in the second degree | | transparency | |

56 Insurance Supervision Agency 34

| 57 | Film Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia | 34 | |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|--|
| 58 | State Attorney's Office of the Republic of North Macedonia | 34 | |
| 59 | Ministry of Local Self-Government | 34 | |
| 60 | Center for Crisis Management | 34 | |
| 61 | Postal Agency | 33,5 | |
| 62 | Directorate for Protection and Rescue | 33,5 | |
| 63 | Civil Aviation Agency | 33 | |
| 64 | State Transport Inspectorate | 32 | |
| 65 | State Commission for Public Procurement Complaints | 32 | |
| 66 | Auditing body for the audit of the instrument for pre-accession assistance | 32 | |
| 67 | Deposit Insurance Fund | 32 | |
| 68 | Agency for the application of the language spoken by at least 20% of the citizens in the Republic of North Macedonia | 31,5 | |
| 69 | State Sanitary and Health Inspectorate | 31,5 | |

| 70 | Regulatory Commission for Energy and Water Services of the Republic of North Macedonia | 31 | |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|----------------------------------------|
| 71 | Administration for the Protection of Cultural Heritage | 31 | |
| 72 | Central Registry of the Republic of North Macedonia | 31 | |
| 73 | Agency for realization of the rights of communities | 30,5 | |
| 74 | State Inspectorate for Technical Inspection | 30,5 | |
| 75 | Ministry of Foreign Affairs | 30,5 | |
| 76 | Agency for regulation of the railway sector | 30 | |
| 77 | State Communal Inspectorate | 30 | |
| 78 | Secretariat for European Affairs | 30 | |
| 79 | Agency for Medicines and Medical Devices | 30 | |
| 80 | Agency for supporting entrepreneurship of the Republic of North Macedonia | 29,5 | Low level institutions of transparency |
| 81 | Office for representation of the Republic of North Macedonia before the European Court of Human Rights | 29 | |
| 82 | National Agency for European Education Programs and Mobility | 29 | |

83 Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Management 28,5

| 84 | Assembly of the Republic of North Macedonia | 28,5 | |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|--|
| 85 | Center for Vocational Education and Training | 28,5 | |
| 86 | Council for the promotion and supervision of the audit of the Republic of North Macedonia | 27,5 | |
| 87 | Financial Police Authority | 27,5 | |

| 88 | Bureau of Educational Development | 27 | |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------------------|
| 89 | State Election Commission | 27 | |
| 90 | Inspectorate for use of languages | 26,5 | |
| 91 | State Inspectorate for Local Self-Government | 26 | |
| 92 | Financial Intelligence Authority | 26 | |
| 93 | State Industrial Property Office | 25,5 | |
| 94 | Administration for Hydrometeorological Affairs | 25,5 | |
| 95 | Bureau of Forensic Expertise | 25 | |
| 96 | Administration for enforcement of sanctions | 25 | |
| 97 | Spatial Planning Agency | 24,5 | |
| 98 | Agency for Quality and Accreditation of Healthcare Institutions | <u>24</u> | |
| 99 | Commodity Reserve Agency | 24 | |
| 100 | State Environmental Inspectorate | 24 | |
| 101 | Administration for keeping the registry books | 24 | |
| 102 | Health Insurance Fund of the Republic of North Macedonia | 23,5 | |
| 103 | Foreclosed Property Management Agency | 23 | |
| 104 | President of the Republic of North Macedonia | 22 | |
| 105 | Agency for youth and sports | 21,5 | |
| 106 | Housing Regulatory Commission | 20 | |
| 107 | Commission for the Protection of Competition | 18 | Institutions withvery low level of |

| 108 | Operational-technical agency-Skopje | 18 | transparency |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------|------|--------------|
| 109 | Directorate of Technological Industrial Development Zones | 16 | |
| 110 | Intelligence agency | 15,5 | |
| 111 | National Security Agency | 15 | |
| 112 | Agency for emigration of the Republic of North Macedonia | 14 | |

113 Republic Council for Road Traffic Safety 14

| 114 | State Commission for decision-making in the second degree in the field of inspection supervision and misdemeanor procedure | 12,5 |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 115 | Aviation Accident and Serious Incident Investigation Committee | 10 |
| 116 | Ministry of Political System and Community Relations | 7,5 |

Attached: Table of holders who do not have web pages

| Directorate for Dedicated Production |
|-----------------------------------------------|
| State Forestry and Hunting Inspectorate |
| Seed and Planting Authority |
| Phytosanitary Administration |
| State Educational Inspectorate |
| Pedagogical service |
| Port Authority-Ohrid |
| Administration for property and legal affairs |
| State Foreign Exchange Inspectorate |

| Commission for Prevention and Protection from Discrimination |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Service for general and common affairs of the Government |
| Administration for affirming and promoting the culture of the members of the communities |
| Administration for the development and promotion of education in the languages of the members of the communities |

The Agency, conducting the monitoring, determined that the holders can and should improve on the plan of proactivity towards the citizens and that the information they publish should be placed in a separate banner/link under the title LIST OF INFORMATION. In that way, the documents will be available to the applicants, and the number of requests for free access to public information will be reduced. In the future, at the training that the Agency continuously organizes for officials with information holders, it will emphasize active transparency and consistent application of Article 10 of the Law on the Information Security, because in this way the holders help the citizens to better understand the functioning of institutions, their rights and obligations, how they can influence the making of decisions that are reflected on their daily living and work, as well as to make it easier for them to access the services offered by the institutions of the central government.